Student Forum: 
Program Discontinuance 
Data Workshop 

May 7, 2013 - LAC 
10:00 – 11:00 AM, T-1100

May 8, 2013 - PCC 
10:00 – 11:00 AM, FF-107
Data Workshop Objective:

1. Provide students with the hands-on tools to review the data used in the program discontinuance process

2. Address discrepancies in data used in the program discontinuance process and other data provided to ASB
Data Workshop Overview:

Using *Aviation Maintenance/Interior Design* as Examples:

1. Walk through key data discrepancies
   - Number of Impacted Students
   - Degrees & Certificates Awarded
   - Job Growth

2. Walk through specific program discontinuance recommendation criteria

3. Share Summer Teach-Out Schedule
Data Discrepancy 1: Number of Impacted Students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AVIATION MAINTENANCE</th>
<th>Program Discontinuance Data</th>
<th>Data Provided by Trustee Troia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The total number of the individual students that are enrolled in at least one course in the program.</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>363</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data Discrepancy 1:
Number of Impacted Students

Where the 363 number comes from:
LBCC Website, Data For Planning & Program Review
http://www.lbcc.edu/ProgramReview/ProgramReviewData.cfm

Why the difference between 130 and 363?

ENROLLMENT: Total number of seats filled in all class sections in a program; counts the same student multiple times in multiple classes. EXAMPLE: Juan takes AVMNT 202 and AVMNT 203 in the fall semester—this is counted as 2 enrollments, but it is only 1 student.

UNDUPLICATED HEADCOUNT: Total number of individual students in a program; only counts each student once even if the student is in multiple classes
Data Discrepancy 1: Number of Impacted Students

Why is 363 not the total number of students impacted?

LBCC Website, Data For Planning & Program Review
http://www.lbcc.edu/ProgramReview/ProgramReviewData.cfm

- 174 + 189 = 363 Enrollments
- At the most, there could only be 189 individual students
- Most students in Spring 2012 took 1-2 aviation maintenance courses
- The total number of individual students in Spring 2012 was 126
Data Discrepancy 1: Number of Impacted Students

Where does the 130 number come from?
Fall 2012 Data, pulled directly by the Student Records Office

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ENROLLMENT:</th>
<th>There were 203 seats filled in all Aviation Maintenance Courses in Fall 2012; the same student was counted multiple times if he was in multiple classes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>203</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDUPLICATED HEADCOUNT:</td>
<td>There were 130 individual students in the program in Fall 2012; some students took more than one course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>130</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Data Discrepancy 2:
### Degrees & Certificates Awarded

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Discontinuance Data</th>
<th>Data Provided by Trustee Troia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Degrees</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certificates</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data Discrepancy 2:

Degrees & Certificates Awarded

The Source of Student Data:

Chancellor’s Office Data Mart:
- What is reported to the State
- Reflects a snapshot in time (data at a specific date)

LBCC Student Database:
- Source of data reported to the State
- Constantly is updating based on new information (data might be different at different times)
Data Discrepancy 2:
Degrees & Certificates Awarded

Where the **6.5 degrees** and **9 certificates** come from:

California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office Data Mart
http://datamart.cccco.edu/Outcomes/Program_Awards.aspx

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>DEGREES</th>
<th>CERTIFICATES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CO</td>
<td>CSD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005-2006</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006-2007</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007-2008</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008-2009</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009-2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010-2011</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6-YEAR AVERAGE</strong></td>
<td><strong>6.3</strong></td>
<td><strong>6.5</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CO** = Chancellor’s Office Datamart (static)

**CSD** = College’s Student Database pulled in June 2012 (dynamic)
Data Discrepancy 2: Degrees & Certificates Awarded

What is the difference between 9 and 120 certificates?

CCC Chancellor’s Office, Program and Course Approval Process
http://extranet.cccco.edu/Portals/1/AA/ProgramCourseApproval/Handbook_5th%20Ed_DRAFTv4_24_13.pdf

CERTIFICATE OF ACHIEVEMENT: May appear by name on transcript; generally 18+ units; must be approved by Chancellor’s Office and requires rigorous review process; recognized by Chancellor’s Office

CERTIFICATE OF ACCOMPLISHMENT: May NOT appear by name on transcript; less than 18 units; doesn’t require Chancellor’s Office approval or rigorous process; not recognized by Chancellor’s Office

FAA Certificates are NOT considered by the Chancellor’s Office in determining a program’s success.

AVIATION MAINTENANCE
Data Discrepancy 3: Job Growth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>AVIATION MAINTENANCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Program Discontinuance Data</strong></td>
<td><strong>Data Provided by Trustee Troia</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long Beach</td>
<td>-19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Los Angeles County</td>
<td>-1.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data Discrepancy 3: 
Job Growth

What job growth data is required by the State?
The Centers of Excellence: http://coeccc.net/

EMSI – ECONOMIC MODELING SPECIALISTS INTL.
Subscription based, labor market intelligence software that collects and aggregates data from over 90 data sources including:

U.S. Department of Commerce
U.S. Census Bureau
U.S. Department of Labor
U.S. Department of Education
Employment and Training Administration
California Labor Market Information Department (EDD)

EMSI updates projection data on a quarterly basis.

More information can be found at www.economicmodeling.com/data/
Data Discrepancy 3: Job Growth

How do you track a specific program?

LMI data is based on Standard Occupation Classifications (SOC) as published by the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics to collect and analyze data on workers by occupational categories:

SOC 49-3011 Aircraft Mechanics & Service Technicians
SOC 49-2091 Avionics Technicians
SOC 51-2011 Aircraft Structure, Surfaces, Rigging, and Systems Assemblers

CIP/TOP Crosswalk: [http://extranet.cccco.edu/Portals/1/AA/Credit/CrosswalkTOP6to2010CIP.pdf](http://extranet.cccco.edu/Portals/1/AA/Credit/CrosswalkTOP6to2010CIP.pdf)
### Data Discrepancy 3:

#### Job Growth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AVIATION MAINTENANCE</th>
<th>Program Discontinuance Data as of May 2012* (Period 2011-2016)</th>
<th>Data Provided by Trustee Troia (Source &amp; Period Unknown)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Long Beach</td>
<td>-19%</td>
<td>+6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Los Angeles County</td>
<td>-1.7%</td>
<td>+11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Data Source: EMSI*
Discontinuance Criteria:

Interior Design

Criteria Upon Which Discontinuance Recommendation Was Based:

• Extent to which program advances student success
• Degree to which program duplicates programs offered elsewhere in service area
• Workplace demand for program completers

Interior Design Program Assessment Form
Included in ASB Cabinet Program Discontinuance Information Packet
Discontinuance Criteria 1: Student Success in Program

INTERIOR DESIGN

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Discontinuance Data</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Degrees</td>
<td>3.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certificates</td>
<td>5.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Successful Course Completion</td>
<td>52.56%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Discontinuance Criteria 1:
Student Success in Program

Where the 52.56% come from:
California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office Data Mart
http://datamart.cccco.edu/Outcomes/Course_Ret_Success.aspx

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>SUCCESS RATE</th>
<th>SUCCESSFUL ENROLLMENT</th>
<th>TOTAL ENROLLMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FALL 2005</td>
<td>51.05%</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FALL 2006</td>
<td>57.14%</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FALL 2007</td>
<td>63.64%</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FALL 2008</td>
<td>58.90%</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FALL 2009</td>
<td>46.77%</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FALL 2010</td>
<td>44.98%</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-YEAR AVERAGE</td>
<td>52.71%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

INTERIOR DESIGN
Discontinuance Criteria 1: Student Success in Program

Where the **3.17 degrees** and **5.83 certificates** come from:

California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office Data Mart
http://datamart.cccco.edu/Outcomes/Program_Awards.aspx

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>DEGREES CO</th>
<th>DEGREES CSD</th>
<th>CERTIFICATES CO</th>
<th>CERTIFICATES CSD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2005-2006</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006-2007</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007-2008</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008-2009</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009-2010</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010-2011</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-YEAR AVERAGE</td>
<td><strong>3.5</strong></td>
<td><strong>3.17</strong></td>
<td><strong>6.16</strong></td>
<td><strong>5.83</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CO** = Chancellor’s Office Datamart (static)

**CSD** = College’s Student Database pulled in June 2012 (dynamic)
Discontinuance Criteria 2: Declining Job Growth

How do you track a specific program?

LMI data is based on Standard Occupation Classifications (SOC) as published by the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics to collect and analyze data on workers by occupational categories:

SOC 27-1025 Interior Designers

CIP/TOP Crosswalk: [http://extranet.cccco.edu/Portals/1/AA/Credit/CrosswalkTOP6to2010CIP.pdf](http://extranet.cccco.edu/Portals/1/AA/Credit/CrosswalkTOP6to2010CIP.pdf)
Discontinuance Criteria 2: Declining Job Growth

**INTERIOR DESIGN**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Growth Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Long Beach</td>
<td>+6.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Los Angeles County</td>
<td>+8.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Program Discontinuance Data as of May 2012* (Period 2011-2016)
Discontinuance Criteria 3:
Offered by Nearby Colleges

Number of jobs currently available within 50 miles of Long Beach: **61**

Number of jobs projected between 2010-2020 available within 50 miles of Long Beach: **185**

Colleges with Interior Design Programs within 50 miles of Long Beach:

- Fullerton College
- Mt. San Antonio College
- Santa Monica College
- Saddleback College
- Moorpark College
- College of the Canyons
- Los Angeles Mission College
- Interior Designers Institute
- Fashion Institute of Design & Merchandising
- The Art Institute of California
- Westwood College
Discontinuance Criteria: Aviation Maintenance

Criteria Upon Which Discontinuance Recommendation Was Based:

• Cost of program relative to number of students served
• Declining projected local employment growth
• Student access as measured by WSCH:FTEF, enrollments
• Program is offered at nearby colleges
Discontinuance Criteria 1:
Cost of Program Per Student

Annual Program Costs:
- $440,000  Four Full-Time Faculty
- $ 60,000  Part-Time Faculty & Overload Classes
- $100,000  Average Equipment Replacement Costs
- $600,000

Annual Cost Divided by # of Degrees & Certificates:
- $600,000  Annual Program Cost
- \( \frac{600,000}{15.5} \) (6.5 degrees + 9 certificates)
- $ 38,700 per completer

Aviation Maintenance Program Assessment Form
Included in ASB Cabinet Program Discontinuance Information Packet

AVIATION MAINTENANCE
Discontinuance Criteria 2: Declining Job Growth

### AVIATION MAINTENANCE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Discontinuance Data as of May 2012* (Period 2011-2016)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Long Beach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Los Angeles County</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Discontinuance Criteria 3:

**Student Access**

How does the State measure “productivity” in student access?

As a benchmark, the State assumes that a full-time faculty member should teach approximately **five 3-unit classes with 35 students** enrolled in each class, which equals:

\[ 5 \text{ classes} \times 3 \text{ units each} \times 35 \text{ students} = 525 \]

**6-Year Average for ALL CTE Programs**: **471** (31 students)

**6-Year Average for Aviation Maintenance**: **351** (23 students)
Discontinuance Criteria 4: Offered by Nearby Colleges

Number of jobs currently available within 50 miles of Long Beach: 40
Number of jobs projected between 2010-2020 available within 50 miles of Long Beach: 1,014

Colleges with Aviation Maintenance Programs within 50 miles of Long Beach:

- Orange Coast College
- West Los Angeles College
- Mt. San Antonio College
- Crimson Technical College
Data Sources:
Where To Find Data

Enrollment Data: http://www.lbcc.edu/ProgramReview/ProgramReviewData.cfm

Individual Students Impacted: link at http://www.lbcc.edu/programupdates/

Degree & Certificate Completion: http://datamart.cccco.edu/Outcomes/Program_Awards.aspx

Successful Course Completion: http://datamart.cccco.edu/Outcomes/Course_Ret_Success.aspx

Job Growth Data: EMSI report www.economicmodeling.com/data/ available for review at College Advancement Economic Development Office, x. 5015
## College Overview:

### CTE Programs at LBCC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2013</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **CTE Programs**<sup>*</sup>  
Based on 4-digit TOP Codes | 46   | 37   |
| **CTE Degree & Certificate Options Offered** | 148  | 182  |

*Only 9 Programs will be discontinued based on the 4-digit TOP Code definition.
# Summer Teach-Out Schedule:
## All Discontinued Programs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Audio Production</th>
<th>Auto Body</th>
<th>Auto Mechanics</th>
<th>Aviation Maintenance</th>
<th>Carpenter</th>
<th>HVAC</th>
<th>Interior Design</th>
<th>Real Estate</th>
<th>Welding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MUSIC 60</td>
<td>ABODY 419A</td>
<td>AMECH 424</td>
<td>AVMNT 205</td>
<td>CARP213</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUSIC 65</td>
<td>ABODY 419D</td>
<td>AMECH 421</td>
<td>AVMNT 207</td>
<td>ACR 213</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUSIC 68</td>
<td>ABODY 240</td>
<td>AMECH 236</td>
<td>AVMNT 401/601</td>
<td>ACR 214</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUSIC 70</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUSIC 75B</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUSIC 82</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUSIC 96</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### PHOTOGRAPHY

- PHOTO 35
- PHOTO 42
- PHOTO 43

### REAL ESTATE

- NONE

### WELDING

- WELD 211
- WELD 212
- WELD 213